TOWARD STABILITY AND SAFETY
Experiences of people with old criminal records
Table of Contents

Introduction and Executive Summary ................................................................. 3
Seventy-eight million people have an old criminal record .................................. 5
Nearly seven in ten people with an old felony record had difficulty finding a job ................................................................. 6
Alex: Joblessness led to his overdose ................................................................. 7
The safety gaps grow for people with old records who are younger, and black ................................................................. 8
Unaddressed health issues increase challenges with safety and stability ................................................................. 10
Nearly half in prison or jail did not receive rehabilitation while incarcerated ................................................................. 11
Sandy: They told me right then and there that they couldn’t hire me ................................................................. 12
Recommendations to policymakers ................................................................. 13
  1. Incentivize states to remove old records ................................................................. 13
  2. Reallocate resources to reentry workforce development ................................................................. 16
Appendix ................................................................. 17
Data and Methodology ................................................................. 18
About the Organization ................................................................. 19
Introduction and Executive Summary

In June 2020, the Alliance for Safety and Justice (ASJ) commissioned a survey of the experiences of Americans impacted by crime and incarceration, to understand who they are and what they need in order to be safe. Over 4,000 Americans, including more than 500 people with old criminal records, responded to the survey and described their experiences with safety and attitudes about safety policy. The results were published in Toward Shared Safety: The First-Ever National Survey of America’s Safety Gaps, a national study of unmet safety needs and public safety policy preferences. The report was released by the newly launched National Coalition for Shared Safety (NCSS), a group of leading organizations that are advancing community safety solutions and joining together to promote the most effective strategies to achieve public safety for all.

In this brief, Toward Stability and Safety, ASJ delves deeper into the issues faced by 78 million people with old criminal records.

Key findings that Toward Stability and Safety include:

- **Seventy-eight million people have an old criminal record.** For anyone among the estimated 45 million people with at least one past misdemeanor conviction, or the nearly 20 million with a past felony conviction, a past record becomes a significant destabilizing factor.

- **Nearly seven in ten people with an old felony record had difficulty finding a job.** Nearly 7 in 10 adults (69 percent) with an old felony conviction said they have had difficulty finding a job. Six in 10 people (63 percent) with an old record said they had struggled to pay fines and fees, and more than half (58 percent) said they had experienced difficulty finding housing.

- **The safety gaps grow for people with old records.** Four out of 10 people with a past conviction said they were victimized by crime but unable to obtain help (41 percent), and four of ten said they experienced difficulty feeling safe (41 percent).

- **Unaddressed health issues increase challenges with safety and stability.** Sixty-two percent of people with a past conviction said their mental health or substance abuse issues were a factor leading to their conviction. People with past records with untreated mental health issues were also more likely to experience difficulty feeling safe (53 percent), and, if they were victimized by crime, were less likely to be able to obtain help (51 percent).

- **Nearly half of those sentenced to prison or jail did not receive rehabilitation while incarcerated.** Eight out of ten people surveyed with a past conviction indicated they were sentenced to prison or jail as part of their sentence. Nearly half of respondents sentenced to prison or jail did not participate in treatment or rehabilitation as part of their sentence.
Recommendations to policymakers

Federal and state governments can play a critical role in incentivizing policy changes to help increase stability, mobility, health, and safety for people with old records, and for all Americans.

_Toward Stability and Safety_ recommends that federal policymakers:

1. **Incentivize states to remove old criminal records.**

Most states have expungement options, but the process is costly, and data systems do not have the capacity to automate the procedure. The federal government must help states with the process of updating their data and information systems by providing some incentives and fiscal support to make changes so that old criminal records can be automatically removed. A majority of voters surveyed (63 percent) support using federal funding for improving state criminal justice data systems to allow qualifying old convictions to be automatically cleared once they are eligible for removal.

2. **Reallocate resources to reentry workforce programs.**

More than twice as many voters prefer public safety investments focused on job training and placement programs for people released from prison than spending on prisons and jails. Federal policymakers must direct funding to spur new safety priorities, like those that would reallocate funding from prisons and jails to reentry and workforce development programs.
Seventy-eight million people have an old criminal record.

Tens of millions have a past conviction.

An estimated 78 million people in the United States have an old criminal record—that is, one in three adults nationally, and as many as one in two in some states (see estimated number of people with a past record, nationally by state). While some of these numbers overlap, researchers have estimated that as many as 45 million people have a past misdemeanor conviction, and nearly 20 million have a past felony conviction.

There are over 40,000 legal prohibitions on eligibility to many jobs, professional licenses, and housing for people with old records: these prohibitions often thwart their best efforts to stabilize and move forward in their lives. Many of these barriers last a lifetime. The types of barriers people with old records around safety and stability include challenges with:

- **Employment.** Occupations can prohibit people with old records from being eligible to work in them depending on the state, the type of records and the law, including career options that require licenses, like cosmetology or massage therapy. Even an arrest that does not result in a conviction can have an impact on someone’s ability to attain employment. National studies have shown that the country loses anywhere from $78 to $87 billion in gross domestic product (GDP) every year because of the exclusion from many types of employment for people with past felony records alone, and more than $317 billion in earning potential is lost every year because of old records.

By the numbers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimated Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>78 MILLION</td>
<td>people are estimated to have an old criminal record of any kind.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 MILLION</td>
<td>people are estimated to have at least one misdemeanor conviction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 MILLION</td>
<td>Nearly 20 million people are estimated to have a past felony conviction.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Education. Old records have been associated with individuals being less likely to complete high school and enrolling in college. Financial aid options can be limited representing a barrier to someone with an old record advancing in the job market.

Housing. Private landlords and public housing limit the eligibility of people with old records who are not a protected class under the Fair Housing Act. This destabilizes individuals and whole families, and reduces the likelihood of someone owning a home.

Any type of record can negatively impact someone’s stability and safety, but the most severe consequences documented in law affect millions of people with a past conviction. Among those who reported having a past conviction, the overwhelming majority (79 percent) said their life had been either very, somewhat or slightly affected.

Nearly seven in ten people with an old felony record had difficulty finding a job.

Those convicted of a felony are more than twice as likely to say their lives have been “very affected” (56 percent) compared to those whose most serious conviction was a misdemeanor (24 percent) or infraction (22 percent).

Among those living with prior felony convictions:

- Nearly 7 in 10 (69 percent) adults said they had difficulty finding a job after sentence completion;
- Six in 10 (63 percent) said they had struggled to pay fines and fees after sentence completion;
- More than half (58 percent) said they had difficulty finding housing after sentence completion.
Joblessness led to his overdose.

My son, Alex, was 26 years old when he died of a drug overdose. I think his criminal record, and the joblessness that it caused, led to his death.

Alex grew up in Medina County, Ohio, where he was a typical boy. In elementary school, he had perfect attendance four out of six years. He played baseball for 12 years. He was a talented trumpet player and taught himself to play guitar. He loved music and was also a talented artist. He cared deeply about the people that he loved, and he would do anything to help a friend or a stranger.

We knew Alex had addiction issues, and, as a family, we struggled with that. But when Alex was working, he was improving. In one job he had, he earned the owner’s trust and drove a large truck with a spit on the back of it. We could see that when Alex was working, he would stop by the house more frequently: Alex was happy, and he had purpose.

During the time when he was struggling with addiction, Alex was arrested and convicted of a felony for drug possession. Once Alex got to a better place with his recovery and was able to function normally, he could not get a job because of his felony conviction.

Alex could not even get a job at the local dollar store because of his record.

I believe with all my heart that Alex would be alive today if he could have found a job and had been given the opportunity to turn his life around.

We need to have laws in place that automatically remove the barrier that a record can create for someone, resulting in their inability to work, get housing, and go to school. People suffering from addiction, like my son Alex, should not be branded with a felony record for life. We want our loved ones to be successful, and the felony conviction puts up barriers to opportunity.

— Story told by Charles “Chip” Jenkins, father of Alex
The safety gaps grow for people with old records who are younger, and black.

Respondents with any type of past conviction indicated they experienced a wide range of barriers to stability and safety. The safety and stability gap grows for individuals with old records who are black, and younger.

Here are some key findings from the data among people with old records:

- Four out of 10 said they experienced difficulty participating in organized activities such as sports or school programs with their children or family (40 percent). People who were black (46 percent), were under 35 years of age (53 percent), or were crime victims (55 percent) experienced more difficulty participating in these activities.

- Four out of 10 said they experienced difficulty feeling safe (41 percent). People who were black (45 percent), were under 35 years of age (47 percent), or were crime victims (58 percent) experienced more difficulty feeling safe.

- Four out of 10 said they were victimized by crime but unable to obtain help (41 percent). People who were black (43 percent), were under 35 years of age (52 percent), or were crime victims (59 percent) experienced more difficulty obtaining help.

More than a third (36 percent) said they had difficulty gaining admission to school, training, or other education. People who were black (45 percent), were under 35 years of age (51 percent), or were crime victims (47 percent) experienced more difficulty gaining admission to school, training, or other education.

- A third said they experienced difficulty getting student or professional loans (33 percent). People who were black (49 percent), were under 35 years of age (49 percent), or were crime victims (46 percent) experienced more difficulty getting student or professional loans.

- A significant number lost custody of, or visitation rights with, their children (33 percent). People who were black (33 percent), were under 35 years of age (44 percent), or were crime victims (50 percent) experienced more difficulty getting student or professional loans.

- Four out of five people with any type of conviction reported experiencing one of these barriers.
Below is a list of experiences that some people have faced due to a conviction. Please indicate whether or not you have experienced it.

### Difficulty feeling safe

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 35</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crime Victim</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Being victimized by crime but unable to obtain help

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 35</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crime Victim</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Difficulty gaining admission to school, training, or other education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 35</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crime Victim</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Unaddressed health issues increase challenges with safety and stability.

Police, corrections leaders, and the courts report that untreated mental health and substance abuse issues are core drivers of the cycle of crime. About one in seven state and federal prisoners (14 percent) and one in four jail inmates (26 percent) reported experiences that met the threshold for serious psychological distress. At least one in 10 police service calls are responding to an untreated mental health issue. Research suggests that certain types of drug-related crime, like violence related to the distribution of drugs, offenses related to an altered state, and offenses committed to pay for drugs, are fueled largely by addiction.

Overall, nearly 4 out of 10 respondents (38 percent) to the National Safety Gaps Survey said they had experienced a mental health issue, and 15 percent said they had experienced a substance abuse issue. Among those surveyed who had a past conviction, 56 percent said they had experienced some mental health issue, and 53 percent said they had experienced a substance abuse issue.

Having an unaddressed mental health or substance abuse issue increases all the challenges someone with an old record will have with safety and stability.

People with either mental health issues (85 percent) or substance abuse issues (86 percent) were more likely than others to have had their lives affected by an old record (79 percent).

Echoing what police, corrections, and the courts report about untreated health issues having a nexus with safety issues, 62 percent of people with a past conviction said mental health or substance abuse issues was either the top or a major factor leading to their conviction.

The challenges someone may face with stability if they have an old record only increase if that person had an untreated health issue: getting student or professional loans (39 percent), and gaining admission to school, training, or other education (38 percent), become more challenging for someone with an old record if they also have an untreated mental health issue. Health issues can also mean that someone with an old record is more likely to experience difficulty feeling safe (53 percent), and, if they were victimized by crime, are unable to obtain help (50 percent).
Nearly half in prison or jail did not receive rehabilitation while incarcerated.

A wide range of studies from criminologists and the federal government demonstrate that reliance on incarceration as the primary sentence for people convicted of crime does not effectively stop the cycle of crime—far too many people released from incarceration are not prepared for reentry into the workforce. Federal data show 68 percent of people sentenced to prison are arrested for a new crime within three years of release.¹⁴

People living with past convictions that have completed their sentences were surveyed on a variety of issues related to the barriers they face obtaining jobs, housing, and other efforts to stabilize and attain meaningful rehabilitation. Eight out of 10 people surveyed with a past conviction indicated they were sentenced to prison or jail as part of their sentence.

Nearly half of respondents sentenced to prison or jail did not participate in treatment or rehabilitation as part of their sentence. When asked if they received rehabilitation while completing their sentence, such as trauma recovery or mental health treatment, 47 percent said yes, and 49 percent said no (3 percent said they did not know).
They told me right then and there that they couldn’t hire me.

There’s a certain perception of people who have records and I don’t fit the mold. Prior to getting arrested, I was a probation officer in Los Angeles County.

I was celebrating my birthday in a bar, had too much to drink, and ended up getting into a fight with two women in the restroom. I was charged with assault with a deadly weapon because I had a wine glass that broke while we were fighting. I had no prior record at all.

When I first got out, in 2013, I waited a while before looking for work because I was trying to spend as much time as I could with my son. Then I applied for a job as a receptionist, and they asked whether I had a record. When I said yes, they told me right then and there that they couldn’t hire me. After that, I was really demoralized and I gave up for a while. I couldn’t keep applying for jobs with the fear of rejection hanging over my head. It was bad for my self-esteem.

After about a year my husband’s best friend’s wife told me, “This place is hiring and your conviction doesn’t matter. They hire people that have convictions.” When I applied and got the job as a case worker for people coming out of jail and prison, it really helped me get back into my normal life.

But after a couple of years, I felt stuck. I was working with a lot of people who had master’s degrees that were doing therapy, but I didn’t apply to any graduate school programs because of my record. I didn’t think they would let me in, and I didn’t know if they could find a place for me to do the internship I would need to graduate.

That’s another thing people don’t think about. A record is like a black cloud over your head all the time. It’s so hard to further your education or get another job because of the fear associated with a past record and what it can do. So a lot of people don’t even try.

People with records come from all different walks of life. You have rich people, poor people, Black people, white people. Yes, they take whatever they can when they first get out. But they want what everyone wants: a good job so they can support their family and contribute to their household.

If my record were sealed, I’d like to become a psychiatric nurse practitioner. I don’t know if I could do that now because they deal with controlled substances—I’d have to be certified by a government agency and I think my record would be an obstacle.

Giving people a pathway for hope will help. Because if there’s a pathway for hope, they’re going to take it. Just like me.
Recommendations to policymakers

These findings paint a critically important picture for decision-makers. Vulnerable Americans lack many important basics when it comes to increasing safety, stopping the cycle of crime, and attaining the stability everyone needs to contribute to our economy. Difficulty attaining jobs, housing, and an education mean many more Americans will experience less safety and stability. Experiencing a health issue and attaining treatment are also key gaps to stability and safety faced by people with old records.

Towards Stability and Safety offers two principal recommendations to federal policymakers to reduce the barriers to stability and safety.

1. Incentivize states to remove old records.

When people living with old records are ineligible for jobs, housing, loans and more, long after their sentences are completed, attaining stability and reintegration is near impossible. Despite strong public support for redemption, legal barriers remain in place that prevent second chances.

Expunging criminal records and lifting bans on eligibility from jobs, housing, and other stabilizing supports are two critical mechanisms by which to improve reentry for people exiting the justice system.

Record expungement provides people who have completed their sentences and remain crime-free with the opportunity to have the old criminal record removed, and alleviates that record from being a barrier to gainful employment, housing, and more. Most states have expungement options, but the process is costly, onerous, or opaque, and data systems are not updated or do not have the capacity to automate the procedure. Connecticut, Michigan, Pennsylvania, and Utah have passed laws that allow for some type of automatic relief for old records. One of the biggest policy barriers to shifting to “sunsetting” old records has been furnishing the relevant state departments with the resources to improve their data systems to automate the process.

Federal resources are a significant source of funding for a wide range of public safety programming across the United States. The federal government can help states with the process of updating their data and information systems by providing some incentives and
fiscal support to make the change. A number of existing grant programs could be used to provide these funds to states.

A majority of voters surveyed (63 percent) support using federal funding for improving state criminal justice data systems to allow qualifying old convictions to be automatically cleared once they are eligible for removal. A majority of voters across party and race support this policy.
Majorities across party, age, and income support using federal funding to allow qualifying old convictions to be automatically cleared once they are eligible for removal.

Please indicate whether you support or oppose using federal government funding for each of the following proposal: Improving state criminal justice data systems to allow qualifying old convictions to be automatically cleared once they are eligible for removal.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Support Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democrat</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Republican</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under age 45</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 45 or older</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latino</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suburban</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small towns and rural</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under $75,000</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over $75,000</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Reallocate resources to reentry workforce development.

Voters overwhelmingly chose options beyond incarceration as priorities for public safety dollars that would address the safety gap people with old records experience.

When it comes to public safety, more than twice as many voters (40 percent) said that, among multiple options, job training and placement programs for people released from prison are the most important to fund, compared to prisons and jails (16 percent). Investing only in mental health crisis response and treatment saw more support from voters prompted to select at least two choices from among a range of public safety investments.

Federal policymakers must direct funding to spur new safety priorities, like those that would reallocate funding from prisons and jails to reentry and workforce development programs.

More than four out of five voters prefer public safety investments focused on mental health reentry prevention and victims services, over prisons and jails.

When it comes specifically to public safety, which two of the following are most important to fund?
# Appendix

**Estimates of the number of individuals with an old criminal record**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimate of the individuals with a criminal record</th>
<th>Estimated portion of the adult population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National 78,715,210</td>
<td>About 1 in 3 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arizona 1,391,880</td>
<td>About 1 in 4 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California 7,382,620</td>
<td>About 1 in 4 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida 4,729,410</td>
<td>About 1 in 4 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois 5,231,380</td>
<td>About 1 in 2 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan 1,882,020</td>
<td>About 1 in 4 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey 1,798,790</td>
<td>About 1 in 4 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York 5,759,320</td>
<td>About 1 in 3 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio 1,781,780</td>
<td>About 1 in 5 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania 2,382,940</td>
<td>About 1 in 4 adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas 10,806,250</td>
<td>About 1 in 2 adults</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data and Methodology

Alliance for Safety and Justice commissioned the National Safety Gaps Survey to fill in gaps in knowledge about crime victims, people with past convictions, and people with mental health and substance abuse challenges; that is, who they are, what their experiences are with various systems, and their views on public policy. The survey also fills in gaps on what likely voters think about these issues and the policies they would want enacted, and assesses voters’ support for policy change.

David Binder Research and GS Strategy Group conducted the survey in English and Spanish from June 20–26, 2020. The poll was administered through an online panel, a sample of persons who have agreed to complete surveys via the internet. Using demographic benchmarks from Census data, sample quotas and weights were used to create a survey sample representative of the U.S. adult population. Results reported for affected populations are based on respondents’ self-reported experiences in this survey. Likely voters are also identified based on survey responses, and voter questions were asked among a representative subsample of the likely voters identified.

The margin of error among the 511 people convicted of crimes is 4.3 percent. The margin of error is larger for demographic subgroups.
About the Organization

Alliance for Safety and Justice (ASJ) is a national organization that aims to win new safety priorities in states across the country, and brings together diverse crime survivors to advance policies that help communities most harmed by crime and violence.
Endnotes

1 The Brennan Center’s Report explains potential duplication in its estimation of the number of people with a misdemeanor conviction. It states, “some of the 46.8 million people identified using this model may have also spent time in prison, or been convicted of a felony, before or after incurring their misdemeanor conviction. This double counting risk is unavoidable.” Therefore, they use the estimated 45 million instead.


9 One study found that even 10 years after completing high school, arrested youth had about 10 percent lower probability of enrolling in four-year college. Young people with a past arrest that did not result in a conviction are less likely to attain a college degree. Widdowson, AO, Siennick, SE, & Hay, C (2016). The implications of arrest for college enrollment: An analysis of long-term effects and mediating mechanisms. Criminology, 54: 621–652.


The table estimates of the number of individuals with a past arrest record, nationally and for select states, in 2020 represents an updated figure of the number and rate of Americans nationally and in each state who have an arrest record. Methodology adopted from Christman, A. & Natividad Rodriguez, M. (2016). Research Supports Fair Chance Policies. Retrieved from New York: National Employment Law Project: https://www.nelp.org/publication/research-supports-fair-chance-policies, and applied to 2020 figures from the Federal Bureau of Investigation Criminal Justice Information Services. (2020). Interstate Identification Index (III) National Fingerprint File (NFF). Retrieved from: https://www.fbi.gov/services/cjis/com-pact-council/interstate-identification-index-iii-national-fingerprint-file-nff. In 2016, the National Employment Law Project published an estimate using 2012 data that showed, 70 million Americans had an arrest record by taking the number of individual level records in the Federal Bureau of Investigation's Interstate Identification Index system (often referred to as “triple-I”). The 2012 Bureau of Justice Statistics (BJS) survey showed there were over 100 million individual people in the systems, and NELP used a conservative 30 percent reduction of this figure to bring it to 70,417,410. This 30 percent reduction was to account for people in the records system that may be deceased, and individuals listed more than once due to duplication; e.g., if a person is arrested in more than one state. The databases are totaled across states, so when a person is arrested in multiple states they may appear in the main data count more than once. A person being in a single state and counted more than once would be a much more rare oversight in record accuracy. The method of estimating the number of adults nationwide who have an arrest record has been frequently cited in academic and peer reviewed literature (for example, the Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology, the American Journal of Criminal Justice, and Economic Inquiry), by lawmakers, and policy organizations. Goggins, B.R. & DeBacco, D.A. (2020, November 5). Survey of State Criminal History Information Systems, 2018. Retrieved from The National Consortium for Criminal Justice Information and Statistics: https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/bjs/grants/255651.pdf